

NATIONAL OPEN UNIVERSITY OF NIGERIA

University Village, Plot 91, Cadastral Zone, Nnamdi Azikwe Epress Way, Jabi- Abuja

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY REPORT ON EVALUATION OF FINANCIAL BID PRESENTED BY THE CONSULTANT PROJECT QUANTITY SURVEYOR ON THE CONSTRUCTION OF AFRICA CENTRE OF EXCELLENCE ON TECHNOLOGY ENHANCED LEARNING (ACETEL) BUILDING AT NOUN HQ, JABI- ABUJA.

DATE: WEDNESDAY 21ST SEPTEMBER, 2023

1.0 INTRODUCTION

- 1.1. The evaluation and analysis of financial bid for the construction and furnishing of Senate Building at NOUN HQ was duly handled by the Consultant Project Quantity Surveyor engaged for the projects, **Messrs. Gimba & Partners.**
- 1.2. The Project Consultant carried out the assignment and presented the reports of the evaluation to NOUN on the Thursday 19th September, 2023.
- 1.3. The NOUN In-house Tender Evaluation Sub-Committee went through the details of the evaluation conducted by Consultant Project Quantity Surveyor.
- 1.4. Please find hereunder, the details of the comments/summary of bid examination and evaluation carried out on the Bid received.

2.0 RECOMMENDATION

- 2.1. The NOUN Evaluation Sub-Committee unanimously agreed and accepted the recommendations made by the Consultant Project Quantity Surveyor that:
 - 2.1.1. **Messrs. In-situ Holmes Ltd.** who has the Lowest Evaluated Responsive Bid (LERB) in the corrected tender sum of **₦760,785,348.58 (Seven Hundred and Sixty Million, Seven Hundred and Eighty-Five Thousand, Three Hundred and Forty-Eight Naira, Fifty-Eight Kobo)** only with a completion period of Thirty-Two (32) Weeks to be considered for the award.
 - 2.1.2. **NOUN Tenders Board** to recommend to Ministry of Education to obtain the Ministerial Tenders Board approval to award the contract for the construction of ACETEL Building to **Messrs. In-situ Holmes Ltd.** at the Corrected Tender Figure of **₦760,785,348.58 (Seven Hundred and Sixty Million, Seven Hundred and Eighty-Five Thousand, Three Hundred and Forty-Eight Naira, Fifty-Eight Kobo)** only with completion period of Thirty-Two (32) weeks.

- 3.0. See attached appendix for detail evaluation report.

4.0 Evaluation Sub-Committee Members



QS. Kazeem Onubaiye
Ag. Head, Procurement
Chairman



Mr. Felix Nwagba
ACETEL Project Accountant
Member



Arc. Aisha Alfa
ACETEL Project Architect
Member



Mr. Paul Aliyu
ACETEL Internal Auditor
Member



QS. Umar Abdulkadir
Principal Quantity Surveyor
Secretary



NATIONAL OPEN UNIVERSITY OF NIGERIA

PROPOSED CONSTRUCTION OF AFRICA CENTRE OF EXCELLENCE
ON TECHNOLOGY ENHANCED LEARNING (ACETEL) BUILDING

TENDER EVALUATION REPORT AND ANALYSIS

QUANTITY SURVEYORS
GIMBA AND PARTNERS
2D Adisa Plaza, 39 David Ejoor Cres.
Gudu District, Abuja

Tel. : 08033498711, 08037044745
E-mail : gimbapartners@yahoo.com

SEPTEMBER 2023

1.0 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1.1 INTRODUCTION

The National Open University of Nigeria (NOUN) intends to embark upon the Construction of The Africa Centre of Excellence on Technology Enhanced Learning (ACETEL) Building to be situated in the University Headquarters at Plot 91, Cadastral Zone, Nnamdi Azikiwe Expressway, Jabi, Abuja.

1.2 PRE-TENDER ACTION

Further to an earlier pre-qualification exercise, tenderers were issued the bidding documents for the projects. It was based on Selective Tendering process; hence 4 (Four) Tenderers were selected for the bidding. The completed tenders received were opened on the 14th September 2023 at the University. All the Tenderers were represented at the bid opening.

1.3 PURPOSE OF TENDER EVALUATION REPORT

The Tender Evaluation seeks to facilitate the selection of suitable Contractors in all respects, in line with the overall objectives of optimising the cost, achieving the intended quality within a minimal delivery period.

1.4 TENDER EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The evaluation methodology comprises of two major processes; Preliminary examination of bids, detailed evaluation and comparison of bids. In Preliminary Bids Examination, all bids were first examined to determine if they met the minimum eligibility requirements as stipulated in the bidding documents and to ensure the bids are substantially responsive to the bidding documents.

The Evaluation and Comparison of bids comprises detailed checking of arithmetical errors in the tender submissions and comparative analysis of elemental and unit rates. The items considered in the scoring of tenderers include the degree of dispersion

from consultants' estimates, consistency of rates, error margin, and completion period.

1.5 GENERAL ASSESSMENT OF TENDERERS

From the preliminary examination, all the bids submitted were complete as expected; the major rules and regulations of tender procedures were substantially complied with.

1.6 CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Bidders are ranked and recommended as follows

TABLE 1.6A – FINAL RANKING

POSITION	NAME OF TENDERER	TENDER FIGURE	DEVIATION FROM CONSULTANT'S ESTIMATE	COMPLETION PERIOD	REMARKS
1 ST	IN-SITU HOLMES LTD.	760,785,348.58	3.23% more than consultant's	66 WEEKS	Recommended
2 ND	AM' SYNERGY NIG. LTD.	767,186,192.05	4.10% more than consultant's	70 WEEKS	
3 RD	KONSTRAD NIG. LTD.	773,326,774.08	4.93% more than consultant's	68 WEEKS	
	CONSULTANTS' ESTIMATE	736,959,879.55		32 WEEKS	

MESSRS. IN-SITU HOLMES LIMITED has the lowest tender figure and project completion of **N760,785,348.73** and **66weeks** respectively. They are hereby recommended for the award of the contract. However, their project completion period of **66weeks** tendered is on a high side; hence we recommend completion period of **32weeks**.

For whatever reason(s), if **MESSRS. IN-SITU HOLMES LIMITED** decides to withdraw their tender or turn down the client's offer, the tenderers ranked **2nd** and **3rd** above, may be considered at a figure not exceeding the consultant's estimate.

2.0 TENDER ANALYSIS

2.1 TENDER RESULTS

The following particulars were recorded at the opening of tenders: tender sums, tender validity periods and project completion periods for each of the tenderers.

TABLE 2.1A: TENDER RESULTS

SN	TENDERERS	TENDER SUM (N)	COMPLETION PERIOD	CONDITIONS ATTACHED
1	KONSTRAD NIG. LTD.	773,832,404.28	68 WEEKS	Tender Validity: 90Days
2	IN-SITU HOLMES LTD.	760,785,348.73	66 WEEKS	Not Stated
3	AM' SYNERGY NIG. LTD.	765,546,820.28	70 WEEKS	Tender Validity: 90Days
4	HIKAM ENGINEERING & CONSULTANCY LTD..	790,857,157.78	75 WEEKS	Tender Validity: 90Days
	CONSULTANTS ESTIMATE	736,959,879.55	32WEEKS	

2.2 EVALUATION OF TENDERS

Analyses of errors committed in each of the tenders were evaluated. The errors detected were minimal. See analysis in the Table 2.2A below.

TABLE 2.2A: ANALYSIS OF TENDERS

SN	NAME OF TENDERER	SUBMITTED TENDER SUM (N)	CORRECTED TENDER FIGURE	ERROR MAGNITUDE (N)	MARGIN OF ERROR (%)	DEVIATION FROM CONSULTANT'S ESTIMATE (%)
1	KONSTRAD NIG. LTD.	773,832,404.28	773,326,774.80	-505,629.48	-0.07%	+4.93%
2	IN-SITU HOLMES LTD.	760,785,348.73	760,785,348.58	+0.15	-	+3.23%
3	AM' SYNERGY NIG. LTD.	765,546,820.28	767,186,192.05	+1,639,371.77	+0.21%	+4.10%
4	HIKAM ENGINEERING & CONSULTANCY LTD..	790,857,157.78	793,235,592.05	+2,378,434.27	+0.30%	+7.64%
	CONSULTANTS ESTIMATE	736,959,879.55				

.....
DIRECTOR, DIRECTORATE OF PHYSICAL DEVELOPMENT
WORKS AND SERVICES

.....
HEAD OF PROCUREMENT

[Handwritten Signature]
.....
CONSULTANTS

26/09/2023

2.3 COMPARISON TABLE OF UNIT RATES

The rates of selected major items of the works have been extracted from each of the tender and tabled alongside the consultants on Table 2.3A to determine the responsiveness and reliability of the tender.

TABLE 2.3A: UNIT RATES COMPARISON

SN	TENDERERS	Concrete Grade 25 (m3)	Reinf. bar (kg)	Formwork (m2)	225mm Sandcrete Block work (m2)	0.70mm Aluminium Roofing Sheet (m2)	1800 x 1200mm Aluminium window (nr)	15mm thick wall rendering (m2)	Emulsion paint (Dulux) & Screeding (m2)	Vitrified Tiles (m2)
	CONSULTANTS	71,000	850	5,000	8,450	12,000	177,120	2,500	3,000	8,000
1	KONSTRAD NIG. LTD.	76,000	820	4,700	8,500	6,800	150,000	2,100	3,200	9,800
2	IN-SITU HOLMES LTD.	71,500	800	4,400	9,600	12,000	172,800	2,500	3,000	8,500
3	AM' SYNERGY NIG. LTD.	77,000	790	4,100	8,500	6,800	150,000	2,100	3,200	9,800
4	HIKAM ENGINEERING & CONSULTANCY LTD..	80,000	850	4,800	8,500	6,800	165,000	2,100	3,200	9,800

SN	TENDERERS	400 x 150mm thick polystyrene block (m)	500A TP&N MV Panel (nr)	13A Twin Socket (nr)	4 x 150mm pvc/swa/pvc Cable (m)	Water Closet (nr)	Wash hand basin (nr)
	CONSULTANTS	5,000	2,800,000	5,600	136,550	120,000	45,000
1	KONSTRAD NIG. LTD.	8,000	800,000	3,000	185,000	52,500	33,600
2	IN-SITU HOLMES LTD.	5,153	2,000,000	4,200	140,000	120,000	35,000
3	AM' SYNERGY NIG. LTD.	8,000	800,000	3,000	185,000	52,500	33,600
4	HIKAM ENGINEERING & CONSULTANCY LTD..	8,000	800,000	3,000	185,000	52,500	33,600

While most of the rates above compares favourably with that of the consultant's, a few others show a disparity.

2.4 COMPARISON TABLE OF ELEMENTAL COSTS

Table 2.4A, 24B and 24C below shows the comparison of the cost of various elements of the project as offered by the tenderers. The elemental costs of the building as quoted by the tenderers, and that of the consultants are listed for comparison.

TABLE 2.4A: COMPARISON TABLE OF GENERAL SUMMARY

S/N	DESCRIPTION	CONSULTANTS (N)	KONSTRAD NIG. LTD.	IN-SITU HOLMES LTD.	AMT SYNERGY NIG. LTD	HIKAM ENGINEERING & CONSULTANCY, LTD
	PRELIMINARIES	25,000,000.00	15,406,560.00	18,000,000.00	25,000,000.00	25,000,000.00
1	MAIN BUILDING	584,652,304.00	625,014,244.00	609,992,998.00	619,730,074.00	637,154,074.00
2	EXTERNAL WORKS	51,008,270.00	54,069,440.00	54,830,803.00	44,048,000.00	50,856,000.00
	CONTINGENCY SUM	15,000,000.00	15,000,000.00	15,000,000.00	15,000,000.00	15,000,000.00
	ENVIRONMENTAL & SOCIAL MANAGEMENT PLAN COST	9,883,500.00	9,883,500.00	9,883,500.00	9,883,500.00	9,883,500.00
	SUB-TOTAL	685,544,074.00	719,373,744.00	707,707,301.00	713,661,574.00	737,893,574.00
	V A T - 7.5%	51,415,805.55	53,953,030.80	53,078,047.58	53,524,618.05	55,342,018.05
	TENDER SUM	736,959,879.55	773,326,774.80	760,785,348.58	767,186,192.05	793,235,592.05

TABLE 2.4B: COMPARISON TABLE OF MAIN BUILDING ELEMENTS

S/N	DESCRIPTION	CONSULTANTS (N)	KONSTRAD NIG. LTD.	IN-SITU HOLMES LTD.	AMT SYNERGY NIG. LTD	HIKAM ENGINEERING & CONSULTANCY, LTD
1	SUBSTRUCTURE	78,076,565.00	76,474,220.00	81,022,694.00	76,851,700.00	80,366,200.00
2	FRAMES & SUSP. SLABS	100,666,050.00	113,216,920.00	98,965,941.00	109,917,840.00	116,475,400.00
3	STAIRCASES AND RAMP	14,373,485.00	13,616,660.00	13,942,280.00	13,393,370.00	13,910,680.00
4	ROOF	52,971,965.00	54,986,450.00	53,622,300.00	54,148,270.00	56,122,400.00
5	INT & EXT WALLS	31,086,850.00	31,899,510.00	35,323,300.00	31,746,130.00	32,014,740.00
6	WINDOWS	34,626,820.00	36,016,240.00	35,458,100.00	35,836,080.00	39,317,750.00
7	DOORS	28,977,500.00	38,251,940.00	26,555,960.00	38,167,080.00	38,329,800.00
8	FIXTURES AND FITTINGS	2,500,000.00	2,500,000.00	2,500,000.00	2,500,000.00	2,500,000.00
9	WALL FINISHES	48,745,965.00	47,663,190.00	48,439,960.00	47,663,190.00	47,663,190.00
10	CEILING FINISHES	15,050,500.00	15,511,370.00	15,117,050.00	15,511,370.00	15,511,370.00
11	FLOOR FINISHES	33,337,100.00	36,037,120.00	36,520,100.00	36,037,120.00	36,037,120.00
12	ELECTRICAL SERVICES	116,062,149.00	134,936,350.00	131,729,383.00	133,979,250.00	134,926,750.00
13	MECHANICAL SERVICES	28,177,355.00	23,993,674.00	30,796,960.00	23,978,674.00	23,978,674.00
	TOTAL	584,652,304.00	625,014,244.00	609,992,998.00	619,730,074.00	637,154,074.00

TABLE 2.4C: COMPARISON TABLE OF EXTERNAL WORKS ELEMENTS

S/N	DESCRIPTION	CONSULTANTS (R)	KONSTRAD NIC. LTD.	IN-SITU HOLMES LTD.	AM' SYNERGY NIC. LTD	HIKAM ENGINEERING & CONSULTANCY. LTD
1	EXTERNAL CIVIL WORKS	25,249,450.00	24,626,180.00	25,333,750.00	18,810,920.00	21,262,740.00
2	EXTERNAL MECHANICAL SERVICES	14,814,820.00	14,888,860.00	13,967,330.00	12,761,880.00	14,888,860.00
3	EXTERNAL ELECTRICAL SERVICES	10,944,000.00	14,554,400.00	15,472,000.00	12,475,200.00	14,704,400.00
	TOTAL	51,008,270.00	54,069,440.00	54,771,080.00	44,048,000.00	50,856,000.00

2.5 FINAL RANKING AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The tender figures are listed in the order of responsiveness as shown in Table 2.5A with their dispersions to highlight their closeness or otherwise to the Consultant's pre-tender cost estimate.

TABLE 2.5A – FINAL RANKING

POSITION	NAME OF TENDERER	TENDER FIGURE	DEVIATION FROM CONSULTANT'S ESTIMATE	COMPLETION PERIOD	REMARKS
1 ST	IN-SITU HOLMES LTD.	760,785,348.58	3.23% more than consultant's	66 WEEKS	Recommended
2 ND	AM' SYNERGY NIG. LTD.	767,186,192.05	4.10% more than consultant's	70 WEEKS	
3 RD	KONSTRAD NIG. LTD.	773,326,774.08	4.93% more than consultant's	68 WEEKS	
4 TH	HIKAM ENGINEERING & CONSULTANCY LTD.	793,235,592.05	7.64% more than consultant's	75 WEEKS	
	CONSULTANTS' ESTIMATE	736,959,879.55		32WEEKS	

From Table 2.5A above, All the tenderers are above the consultant's Estimated Cost. **MESSRS. IN-SITU HOLMES LIMITED** has the lowest tender figure of **N760,785,348.58**; and with a deviation of +3.23% from the consultant's estimate. They have a Completion Period of **66 weeks**. Hence, they are ranked 1st among the 4 tenderers. If they are to be considered for the award, we recommend that they are offered **32weeks** completion period.

The second lowest is **MESSRS. AM' SYNERGY NIGERIA LIMITED** with the tender figure of **N767,186,192.05**; and a deviation of +4.10% from the consultant's estimate. They have a Completion Period of **70weeks**. They can be invited for a negotiation if the lowest tenderer withdraws from the tendering process or declines to accept the work.

MESSRS. KONSTRAD NIGERIA LIMITED is the 3rd on the ranking with the tender sum of **N773,326,774.08**. Their offer is at a deviation of +4.93% from the consultant's estimate. They have a Completion Period of **68weeks**.

MESSRS. HIKAM ENGINEERING AND CONSULTANCY LIMITED is the 4th on the ranking with the tender sum of **N1793,235,592.05**. Their tender is at a deviation of +7.64% from the consultant's estimate. With a Completion Period of **75 weeks**.

3.0 APPENDIX

KONSTRAD NIGERIA LIMITED
8 VIKING STREET, SAPELE ROAD,
BENIN CITY, EDO STATE

The Director of Procurement,
National Open University of Nigeria (NOUN),
University Village, Plot 91, Nnamdi Azikiwe Expressway,
Jabi, Abuja, Nigeria.

13/09/2023.


Dear Sir,

**TENDER FOR CONSTRUCTION OF AFRICAN CENTER FOR TECHNOLOGY EN-
HANCED LEARNING (ACETEL) BUILDING AT NATIONAL OPEN UNIVERSITY OF
NIGERIA (NOUN) HQ**

Reference the above project, we hereby tender for the works for the sum of N773,832,404.28 with a validity period of 90 days. The bills of quantities for our tender are herewith attached.

We propose to execute the project within a period of 68 weeks if we are awarded the contract.

Yours sincerely,



George Adams
Managing Director



RC. 679747

In-Situ Holmes Limited

Building + Civil Engineering Construction + Project Management

The Director of Procurement,
National Open University of Nigeria (NOUN),
University Village, Plot 91, Cadastral Zone,
Nnamdi Azikiwe Expressway,
Jabi, Abuja, Nigeria.

September 13, 2023

Dear Sir,

Re: Construction of the African Centre of Excellence on Technology Enhanced Learning (ACETEL) Building at National Open University of Nigeria (NOUN) HQ

We are pleased to tender for the construction and completion of the above project in the total sum of **₦760,785,348.73 (Seven hundred and sixty million, seven hundred and eighty-five thousand, three hundred and forty-eight Naira and seventy-three kobo)** only. The detailed breakdown of this sum is contained in the enclosed priced bills of quantities.

We offer to carry out and complete the project within a period of **sixty-six (66) weeks**, including a mobilization period of **two (2) weeks**.

This offer remains valid for a period of **ninety (90) days** from date.

Grateful for your kind considerations.

Yours faithfully,

For: Insitu Holmes Ltd

Mohammed Musa
Executive Director

DIRECTORS:
OLOJOTUYI BAMIDELE SEGUN (NIG.)
OTAIRU ABDULGANIYU (NIG.)

Suite B5, 1st Floor, Abraham Plaza, Plot 2, Ukuhinam Street, Utako, Abuja.
Tel/Fax: 08052261288, 08035965317.

Email: insituholmes_ywt@yahoo.com

AM' SYNERGY NIGERIA LIMITED

RC 975632

Suite A6, Innovation Plaza, Plot 770 Behind Wuye
Market, Wuye District, Abuja.

Phone: 08033293678

Email: amsynergyniglt@gmail.com

The Director of Procurement,
National Open University of Nigeria (NOUN),
University Village,
Plot 91, Cadastral Zone,
Nnamdi Azikiwe Expressway,
Jabi, Abuja,
Nigeria.

September 11, 2023

Dear Sir,

Construction of the African Centre of Excellence on Technology Enhanced Learning (ACETEL) Building at National Open University of Nigeria (NOUN) HQ

We wish to submit our tender for the construction of the ACETEL building for the sum of N765,546,820.28 (seven hundred and sixty-five million, five hundred and forty-six thousand, eight hundred and twenty Naira and twenty-eight kobo only) with a completion period of 70 weeks.

You will find attached our priced bills of quantities for the works. The validity period of our tender is 90 days.

We look forward to receiving your grant of award for the project.

Thank you,



Abubakar Umar
For: Managing Director



HIKAM ENGINEERING AND CONSULTANCY LTD

Shop 112, First Floor, Kings Shopping Complex
Ahmadu Bello Way,
Abuja.

Phone: 08102074041
Email: hikamltd@gmail.com

The Director of Procurement,
National Open University of Nigeria (NOUN),
University Village,
Plot 91, Nnamdi Azikiwe Expressway,
Jabi, Abuja, Nigeria.

12th September, 2023.

Dear Sir,

Construction of ACETEL Building at National Open University of Nigeria (NOUN) HQ

We wish to submit out tender for the construction of the ACETEL building for the sum of N790,857.157.78 with a completion period of 75 weeks and validity period of 90 days.

Our priced bills of quantities for the works are enclosed accordingly.
We hope our tender meets your approval.

Yours faithfully,



Habib Ibrahim Usman
